Hydrodynamic modelling of planet-disk interaction and planet migration

> Hands-on Numerical Astrophysics School for Exoplanetary Sciences July 4-8, 2022 Hanau-Steinheim

5 July 2022, Sareh Ataiee



dowsi University of Mashhad

Outline

- What is a planet?
- Force, torque, and power
- Lindblad and co-rotation torques
- Gap opening
- Planetary migration
- Put your knowledge in practice using FARGO3D

What is a planet?

Our migration-wise definition:

- A planet (in a disc)
 - is a solid object (not a gas parcel)
 - orbits around one (more) star(s)
 - is moving mostly due to the gravitational forces

What is a planet?

Our migration-wise definition:

- A planet (in a disc)
 - is a solid object (not a gas parcel)
 - orbits around one (more) star(s)
 - is moving mostly due to the gravitational forces

$$\frac{d \mathbf{v}}{dt} = \mathbf{a}$$

For a solid in a disc $\rightarrow = \mathbf{a}_{\text{star}} + \mathbf{a}_{\text{gas drag}} + \mathbf{a}_{\text{disc gravity}}$
if $\begin{cases} \mathbf{a}_{\text{gas drag}} \ll \mathbf{a}_{\text{disc gravity}} & \text{Planet} \\ \mathbf{a}_{\text{gas drag}} \gg \mathbf{a}_{\text{disc gravity}} & \text{Dust particle} \end{cases}$

What is a planet?

Our migration-wise definition:

- A planet (in a disc)
 - is a solid object (not a gas parcel)
 - orbits around one (more) star(s)
 - is moving mostly due to the gravitational forces **Numerically**:
 - is a gravitational point source

Torque:
$$\delta \mathbf{\Gamma} = \mathbf{r} \times \delta \mathbf{f} = \delta \frac{d \mathbf{L}_p}{dt}$$
 $\mathbf{L}_p = m_p \sqrt{G M_* a} \sqrt{1 - e^2} \mathbf{k}$
Power: $\delta P = \mathbf{v} \cdot \delta \mathbf{f} = \delta \frac{dE_p}{dt}$ $E_p = -\frac{G m_p M_*}{2a}$

 δf

Torque: $\delta \mathbf{\Gamma} = \mathbf{r} \times \delta \mathbf{f} = \delta \frac{d \mathbf{L}_p}{dt}$ $\mathbf{L}_p = m_p \sqrt{G M_* a} \sqrt{1 - e^2} \mathbf{k}$ Power: $\delta P = \mathbf{v} \cdot \delta \mathbf{f} = \delta \frac{d E_p}{dt}$ $E_p = -\frac{G m_p M_*}{2 a}$

 $\delta \mathbf{\Gamma}|_{z} = \mathbf{r} \times \delta \mathbf{f} < 0 \Rightarrow \delta \frac{d \mathbf{L}_{p}}{dt}|_{z} < 0 \quad \text{planet loses angular momentum}$ $\delta \mathbf{\Gamma}|_{z} = \mathbf{r} \times \delta \mathbf{f} > 0 \Rightarrow \delta \frac{d \mathbf{L}_{p}}{dt}|_{z} > 0 \quad \text{planet gains angular momentum}$

05/07/2022

Torque: $\delta \mathbf{\Gamma} = \mathbf{r} \times \delta \mathbf{f} = \delta \frac{d \mathbf{L}_p}{dt}$ $\mathbf{L}_p = m_p \sqrt{G M_* a} \sqrt{1 - e^2} \mathbf{k}$ Power: $\delta P = \mathbf{v} \cdot \delta \mathbf{f} = \delta \frac{dE_p}{dt}$ $E_p = -\frac{G m_p M_*}{2 a}$

 $\delta P = \mathbf{v} \cdot \delta \mathbf{f} < 0 \Rightarrow \delta \frac{d E_p}{dt} < 0 \quad \text{planet loses energy}$ $\delta P = \mathbf{v} \cdot \delta \mathbf{f} > 0 \Rightarrow \delta \frac{d E_p}{dt} > 0 \quad \text{planet gains energy}$

Torque:
$$\delta \mathbf{\Gamma} = \mathbf{r} \times \delta \mathbf{f} = \delta \frac{d \mathbf{L}_p}{dt}$$
 $\mathbf{L}_p = m_p \sqrt{G M_* a} \sqrt{1 - e^2} \mathbf{k}$
Power: $\delta P = \mathbf{v} \cdot \delta \mathbf{f} = \delta \frac{d E_p}{dt}$ $E_p = -\frac{G m_p M_*}{2 a}$
Torque: $\mathbf{\Gamma} = \int_{\text{disc}} \mathbf{r} \times \delta \mathbf{f} = \frac{d \mathbf{L}_p}{dt}$
Power: $P = \int_{\text{disc}} \mathbf{v} \cdot \delta \mathbf{f} = \frac{d E_p}{dt}$

05/07/2022

 δf

Torque:
$$\Gamma = \int_{\text{disc}} \mathbf{r} \times \delta \mathbf{f} = \frac{d \mathbf{L}_p}{dt} \quad \mathbf{L}_p = m_p \sqrt{G M_* a} \sqrt{1 - e^2} \mathbf{k}$$

Power: $P = \int_{\text{disc}} \mathbf{v} \cdot \delta \mathbf{f} = \frac{dE_p}{dt} \quad E_p = -\frac{G m_p M_*}{2 a}$

For a circular planet (e = 0):

 $\Gamma_{z} = \frac{dL_{p}}{dt} = m_{p} \frac{\sqrt{GM_{*}}}{2\sqrt{a}} \dot{a} = \frac{L_{p}}{2} \frac{\dot{a}}{a}$ $P = \frac{dE_{p}}{dt} = m_{p} \frac{GM_{*}}{2a^{2}} = -E_{p} \frac{\dot{a}}{a}$ $\Gamma_{a} = \frac{dE_{p}}{a} = \frac{L_{p}}{2\Gamma} = \frac{|E_{p}|}{P}$

05/07/2022

Torque:
$$\Gamma = \int_{\text{disc}} \mathbf{r} \times \delta \mathbf{f} = \frac{d \mathbf{L}_p}{dt} \quad \mathbf{L}_p = m_p \sqrt{G M_* a} \sqrt{1 - e^2} \mathbf{k}$$

Power: $P = \int_{\text{disc}} \mathbf{v} \cdot \delta \mathbf{f} = \frac{dE_p}{dt} \quad E_p = -\frac{G m_p M_*}{2 a}$

For a circular planet (e = 0):

$$\tau_{\rm a} = \frac{a}{\dot{a}} = \frac{L_p}{2\Gamma} = \frac{|E_p|}{P}$$

Green part wins \rightarrow Torque and power on a planet are negative \rightarrow The planet's semi-major axis decreases

Torque:
$$\Gamma = \int_{\text{disc}} \mathbf{r} \times \delta \mathbf{f} = \frac{d \mathbf{L}_p}{dt} \quad \mathbf{L}_p = m_p \sqrt{G M_* a} \sqrt{1 - e^2} \mathbf{k}$$

Power: $P = \int_{\text{disc}} \mathbf{v} \cdot \delta \mathbf{f} = \frac{dE_p}{dt} \quad E_p = -\frac{G m_p M_*}{2a}$

Surface density perturbation \rightarrow exerts torque/power on the planet \rightarrow changes the planet's angular momentum/ energy \rightarrow changes the planet's semi-major axis

Migration

Torque:
$$\Gamma = \int_{\text{disc}} \mathbf{r} \times \delta \mathbf{f} = \frac{d \mathbf{L}_p}{dt} \quad \mathbf{L}_p = m_p \sqrt{G M_* a} \sqrt{1 - e^2} \mathbf{k}$$

Power: $P = \int_{\text{disc}} \mathbf{v} \cdot \delta \mathbf{f} = \frac{dE_p}{dt} \quad E_p = -\frac{G m_p M_*}{2 a}$

For an eccentric planet (0 < e < 1):



Torque:
$$\Gamma = \int_{\text{disc}} \mathbf{r} \times \delta \mathbf{f} = \frac{d \mathbf{L}_p}{dt} \quad \mathbf{L}_p = m_p \sqrt{G M_* a} \sqrt{1 - e^2} \mathbf{k}$$

Power: $P = \int_{\text{disc}} \mathbf{v} \cdot \delta \mathbf{f} = \frac{dE_p}{dt} \quad E_p = -\frac{G m_p M_*}{2 a}$

For an eccentric planet (0 < e < 1):

If a planet is eccentric, torque does **NOT** give the direction of migration.



05/07/2022

A planet divides the disc in two regions:

- far from its orbit (circulating)
- around its orbit (horseshoe)



A planet divides the disc in two regions:

- far from its orbit (circulating)
- around its orbit (horseshoe)
 Two main sources of surface density perturbation:
 - Wakes resulting from the Lindblad resonances
 - Horseshoe motion of gas in the co-orbital region



$$\begin{aligned} & \textbf{Lindblad and co-rotation torques} \\ & \textbf{Goldreich & Tremaine 1979} \\ & \frac{\partial \boldsymbol{v}_1}{\partial t} + (\boldsymbol{v}_0 \cdot \nabla) \boldsymbol{v}_1 + (\boldsymbol{v}_1 \cdot \nabla) \boldsymbol{v}_0 = -\nabla(\varphi_1 + \varphi_1^D + \eta_1), \\ & \frac{\partial \sigma_1}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\sigma_0 \boldsymbol{v}_1) + \nabla \cdot (\sigma_1 \boldsymbol{v}_0) = 0, \\ & \eta_1 = c_0^{2}(\sigma_1/\sigma_0), \\ & \nabla^2 \varphi_1^D = 4\pi G \sigma_1 \delta(z), \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \mathbf{v}_{1}}{\partial t} & \leftarrow \mathbf{U}_{1} \\ \frac{\partial \mathbf{v}_{1}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{v}_{0} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{v}_{1} + (\mathbf{v}_{1} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{v}_{0} = -\nabla(\varphi_{1} + \varphi_{1}{}^{D} + \eta_{1}), \\ \frac{\partial \sigma_{1}}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\sigma_{0} \mathbf{v}_{1}) + \nabla \cdot (\sigma_{1} \mathbf{v}_{0}) = 0, \\ \eta_{1} &= c_{0}^{2}(\sigma_{1}/\sigma_{0}), \\ \nabla^{2} \varphi_{1}{}^{D} &= 4\pi G \sigma_{1} \delta(z), \\ \frac{X = X(r) \exp i(m\theta - \omega t)}{r} & u_{1} &= -\frac{i}{D} \left[(m\Omega - \omega) \frac{d}{dr} + \frac{2m\Omega}{r} \right] (\varphi_{1} + \varphi_{1}{}^{D} + \eta_{1}), \\ v_{1} &= \frac{1}{D} \left[2B \frac{d}{dr} + \frac{m}{r} (m\Omega - \omega) \right] (\varphi_{1} + \varphi_{1}{}^{D} + \eta_{1}), \end{aligned}$$

05/07/2022

Goldreich & Tremaine 1979

$$\left\{\frac{d^2}{dr^2} + \left[\frac{d}{dr}\ln\left(\frac{\sigma r}{D}\right)\right]\frac{d}{dr} + \frac{2m\Omega}{r(m\Omega - \omega)}\left[\frac{d}{dr}\ln\left(\frac{\sigma\Omega}{D}\right)\right] - \frac{m^2}{r^2}\right\}(\varphi_1 + \varphi_1^D + \eta_1) = \frac{D\eta_1}{c^2}$$
$$D = \kappa^2 - (m\Omega - \omega)^2$$

Singularities:
1)
$$D = 0$$
 Lindblad resonance
2) $m\Omega - \omega = 0$ Co-rotation resonance

Lindblad resonances $m(\Omega(r) - \Omega_p) = \pm \kappa \sqrt{(1 + m^2 h^2)}$

- *m*: an integer
- $\Omega(r)$: gas angular velocity
- Ω_p : planet angular velocity
- κ : epicyclic frequency
- *h*: disc aspect ratio



Lindblad resonances $m(\Omega(r) - \Omega_p) = \pm \kappa \sqrt{(1 + m^2 h^2)}$

- *m*: an integer
- $\Omega(r)$: gas angular velocity
- Ω_p : planet angular velocity
- κ : epicyclic frequency
- *h*: disc aspect ratio





Lindblad resonances $m(\Omega(r) - \Omega_p) = \pm \kappa \sqrt{(1 + m^2 h^2)}$

Torque from the outer wake < 0 Torque from the inner wake > 0

 \rightarrow Net torque determines the migration of the planet

Differential Lindblad Torque



Lindblad resonances $m(\Omega(r) - \Omega_p) = \pm \kappa \sqrt{(1 + m^2 h^2)}$

 $\Omega(r)$ depends on the disc pressure gradient

The **location** of Lindblad resonances depends on **pressure profile**:

Density and Temperature gradient can change the Lindblad torque.



Lindblad resonances $m(\Omega(r) - \Omega_p) = \pm \kappa \sqrt{(1 + m^2 h^2)}$

There is a **pile-up** of resonance location about $H \rightarrow$ the main contribution should come from this distance



Co-rotation resonance $\Omega(r) = \Omega_p$



Co-rotation resonance $\Omega(r) = \Omega_p$

• r_{co} is not necessarily r_{p}



Co-rotation resonance $\Omega(r) = \Omega_p$

- r_{co} is not necessarily r_{p}
- Linear co-rotation torque is small



- r_{co} is not necessarily r_{p}
- Linear co-rotation torque is small
- Horseshoe drag is non-linear (Paardekooper & Papaloizou 2009)



- r_{co} is not necessarily r_{p}
- Linear co-rotation torque is small
- Horseshoe drag is non-linear
- Time matter

$$au_{\text{U-turn}} \sim \frac{H}{x_s} \tau_{\text{dyn}} \qquad au_{\text{lib}} \sim \frac{8 \pi a}{3 \Omega_p x_s}$$



Kley & Nelson 2012

- r_{co} is not necessarily r_{p}
- Linear co-rotation torque is small
- Horseshoe drag is non-linear
- Time matter





- r_{co} is not necessarily r_{p}
- Linear co-rotation torque is small
- Horseshoe drag is non-linear
- Time and diffusion matter





Kley & Nelson 2012



Baruteau & Masset 2013

- r_{co} is not necessarily r_{p}
- Linear co-rotation torque is small
- Horseshoe drag is non-linear
- Time and diffusion matter
- Vortensity and entropy gradients govern the horseshoe drag



Baruteau & Masset 2013

$$\frac{\delta \Sigma}{\Sigma} = \frac{\delta \Sigma}{\Sigma} \left(\frac{\delta l}{l}, \frac{\delta s}{s}\right)$$

: vortensity, *s*: entropy

Co-rotation resonance $\Omega(r) = \Omega_p$

- r_{co} is not necessarily r_{p}
- Linear co-rotation torque is small
- Horseshoe drag is non-linear
- Time and diffusion matter
- Vortensity and entropy gradients govern the horseshoe drag



Baruteau & Masset 2013

For a detailed lecture check out: http://clement.baruteau.free.fr/Bern2017/Baruteau_Bern2017.pdf



Gap opening



Gap opening



Planetary migration

Low-mass planet: type I migration High-mass planet: type II migration Medium-mass planet: (maybe) type III migration

Planetary migration





A versatile multifluid HD/MHD code that runs on clusters of CPUs or GPUs, with special emphasis on protoplanetary disks.



05/07/2022

FARGO: Fast Advection in Rotating Gaseous Objects (Masset 2000)

FARGO: Fast Advection in Rotating Gaseous Objects (Masset 2000)FARGO3D: the 3D successor of FARGO (Benítez- Llambay 2016)

FARGO: Fast Advection in Rotating Gaseous Objects (Masset 2000) FARGO3D: the 3D successor of FARGO (Benítez- Llambay 2016)

- Finite difference explicit Eulerian fixed grid code
- Cartesian, cylindrical or spherical geometry
- Multifluid capability (gas and different dust sizes)
- HD and MHD
- 5th order Runge-Kutta N-body solver

We assume you have already read document and

- installed FARGO3D with the mentioned correction
- have fargo3dplot and managed to import it
- had a look at the structure of the code

We assume you have already read document and

- installed FARGO3D with the mentioned correction
- have fargo3dplot and managed to import it
- had a look at the structure of the code

| arch | fargo3d | license.txt | outputs | README.md | setups | std | utils |
|------|---------|-------------|---------|-----------|--------|------------|-------|
| bin | in | Makefile | planets | scripts | src | test_suite | |

We assume you have already read document and

- installed FARGO3D with the mentioned correction
- have fargo3dplot and managed to import it
- had a look at the structure of the code

| arch | fargo3d | license.txt | outputs | README.md | setups | std | utils |
|------|---------|-------------|---------|-----------|--------|------------|-------|
| bin | in | Makefile | planets | scripts | src | test_suite | |

Our problem \rightarrow Setup files \rightarrow Parallel or Serial \rightarrow Make and Run \rightarrow Read the outputs \rightarrow Analyse

Our problem \rightarrow Setup files \rightarrow Parallel or Serial \rightarrow Make and Run \rightarrow Read the outputs \rightarrow Analyse

Units:

- MKS: all quantities must be given in MKS
- CGS: all quantities must be given in CGS
- Scale-free (default): $G=1, M_*=1, R_0=1 \Rightarrow T=2\pi$

Our problem \rightarrow Setup files \rightarrow Parallel or Serial \rightarrow Make and Run \rightarrow Read the outputs \rightarrow Analyse

| There are four main setup files: | | | | |
|---|--|--|--|--|
| setups/<setup_name>.opt</setup_name> | | | | |
| setups/<setup_name>.par</setup_name> | | | | |
| planets/<planet_name>.cfg</planet_name> | | | | |
| setups/<setup_name>.bound</setup_name> | | | | |

<setup_name>.opt

| 11 | FLUIDS := 0 | |
|----|--|-------------------|
| 12 | NFLUIDS = 1 | |
| 13 | FARG0_OPT += -DNFLUIDS=\${NFLUIDS} | |
| 14 | | |
| 15 | #Monitoring options | |
| 16 | MONITOR_SCALAR = MASS MOM_X TORC |) |
| 17 | MONITOR_Y_RAW = TORQ | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | #Damping zones in the active mesh | |
| 20 | and a second sec | |
| 21 | FARG0_OPT += -DSTOCKHOLM | de Val-Borro+2006 |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | FARG0_OPT += -DX | |
| 24 | FARG0_OPT += -DY | |
| 25 | | |
| 26 | #Equation of State | |
| 27 | FARG0_OPT += -DISOTHERMAL | |
| 28 | | |
| 29 | #Coordinate System. | |
| 30 | FARG0_OPT += -DCYLINDRICAL | |
| 31 | | |
| 32 | #Legacy files for outputs | |
| 33 | FARG0_OPT += -DLEGACY | |
| 34 | | |
| 35 | FARGO_OPT += -DPOTENTIAL | |
| 36 | | |
| 37 | FARG0_0PT += -DALPHAVISCOSITY | |

05/07/2022

<setup_name>.par



05/07/2022

<setup_name>.par



05/07/2022

<setup_name>.par

Setup test1 ### Disk parameters AspectRatio 0.05 Thickness over Radius in the disc Sigma0 6.3661977237e-4 Surface Density at r=1 Alpha 1.0e-4 $v = \alpha c_{e} H$ sity SigmaSlope 1.5 Slope for the surface density FlaringIndex 0.5 Slope for the aspect-ratio # Radial range for damping (in period-ratios). Values smaller than one 11 12 # prevent damping. DampingZone 1.15 # Characteristic time for damping, in units of the inverse local # orbital frequency. Higher values means lower damping TauDamp 0.3 ### Planet parameters PlanetConfig planets/jupiter.cfg ThicknessSmoothing 0.6 Eccentricitv 0.0 ExcludeHill no IndirectTerm Yes

05/07/2022

<setup_name>.par



05/07/2022

<setup_name>.par

Müller1+2012



05/07/2022

N

<setup_name>.par

| 29 30 | ### Mesh pa | rameters | | | |
|----------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|---|---|------------------|
| 31 32 33 | Nx Ny Xmin | 256 128 -3.14159 | Azimuth Radial 92653589 | al number of zones number of zones 79323844 | x is φ y is r |
| 34 35 36 37 38 | xmax Ymin Ymax OmegaFrame Frame | 3.14159. 0.4 2.5 1.0005 C | 26535897 Inner b Outer b Angular Method | 9323844 oundary radius oundary radius velocity for the frame of reference (I [.] for moving the frame of reference | f Frame is F) |
| 39 40 41 | ### Output | control | paramete | rs | |
| 42 43 44 45 | DT Ninterm Ntot | 0.314159 20 1000 | 9265359 | Physical time between fine-grain outpu ⁻ Number of DTs between scalar fields ou ⁻ Total number of DTs | ts tputs |
| 46 47 | OutputDir | @output | s/test1 | | |
| 48 49 | ### Plottin | g parame [.] | ters | | |
| 50 51 52 | PlotLog Spacing | yes Log | | | log only in a |

Mesh parameters

29

<setup_name>.par

| 30 | | | | | |
|----|-------------|----------|----------|-------------------------|---------------------------------|
| 31 | N× | 256 | Azimuth | al number of zones | |
| 32 | Ny | 128 | Radial | number of zones | |
| 33 | Xmin | -3.1415 | 92653589 | 79323844 | |
| 34 | Xmax | 3.14159 | 26535897 | 9323844 | |
| 35 | Ymin | 0.4 | Inner b | oundary radius | |
| 36 | Ymax | 2.5 | Outer b | oundary radius | |
| 37 | OmegaFrame | 1.0005 | Angular | velocity for the frame | of reference (If Frame is F |
| 38 | Frame | С | Method | for moving the frame of | reference |
| 39 | | | | | |
| 40 | ### Output | control | paramete | rs | |
| 41 | | | | | dt: time-step |
| 42 | DT | 0.31415 | 9265359 | Physical time between | DT between two dots |
| 43 | Ninterm | 20 | | Number of DTs between | Ninterm \times DT: one output |
| 44 | Ntot | 1000 | | Total number of DTs | |
| 45 | | | | | Ntot/Ninterm: final output |
| 46 | OutputDir | @output | s/testl | | |
| 4/ | | | . | | |
| 48 | ### PLOTTIN | g parame | ters | | |
| 49 | D1 - +1 | | | | |
| 50 | PlotLog | yes | | | |
| 51 | Spacing | Log | | | |
| 52 | | | | | |

<planet_name>.cfg

| | ################## | ############ | ########## | +++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++ | ####################################### | |
|---|---|----------------------|------------|---|---|--------------|
| 2 | <pre># Planetary sy</pre> | ystem initia | l configu | ration | | |
| 3 | ####################################### | - ############### | ######### | +########### | ####################################### | |
| 4 | | | | | | |
| 5 | <pre># Planet Name</pre> | Distance | Mass | Accretion | Feels Disk | Feels Others |
| 6 | Jupiter | 1.0 | 0.001 | 0.0 | NO | NO |
| 7 | · | | | | | |

<setup_name>.bound

| 1 | #Boundaries configuration file for fargo.bound |
|----|--|
| 2 | # |
| 3 | |
| 4 | Density: |
| 5 | Ymin: KEPLERIAN2DDENS |
| 6 | Ymax: KEPLERIAN2DDENS |
| 7 | |
| 8 | Vx: |
| 9 | Ymin: KEPLERIAN2DVAZIM |
| 10 | Ymax: KEPLERIAN2DVAZIM |
| 11 | |
| 12 | Vy: |
| 13 | Ymin: ANTISYMMETRIC |
| 14 | Ymax: ANTISYMMETRIC |
| 15 | |

Our problem \rightarrow Setup files \rightarrow Parallel or Serial \rightarrow Make and Run \rightarrow **Read the outputs** \rightarrow Analyse

The outputs contains several types:

- Field files: binary, gas<field_name>%n.dat
- Planet files: ASCII
 - > planet%n.dat (every field output)
 - bigplanet%n.dat, orbit%n.dat, tqwk%n.dat (every DT)
- Grid files: ASCII, domain_x.dat, domain_y.dat, domain_z.dat
- Monitoring files: ASCII and binary
- more...

What is the plan?

- Make a setup
- Lindblad torque for a static planet
- Migration of a low-mass planet
- Check out the torque on an eccentric planet
- Surface density perturbation by a massive planet
- See the saturation of the co-rotation torque

Note1: If your computer is not fast enough, you can download the results from the given link in the exercise sheet.

Note 2: Discuss the questions in each section with people around you!

Have fun!

Good reviews for further reading: Kley & Nelson 2012 Baruteau & Masset 2013 Baruteau+2014 Baruteau+2016 Paardekooper+2022



05/07/2022